

18

Compare and contrast authors' purposes to distinguish how their positions differ

Language Objectives

- Identify author's purpose and position.
- Explain how authors use signal words to connect ideas.
- Understand the meaning of domain-specific vocabulary.
- Compare and contrast informational texts on the same topic.

Building Literacy

Comparing and contrasting texts will help students move beyond what is stated by an author by:

- interpreting what an author wants readers to know.
- considering alternative versions of the text.
- making connections across texts and to personal experiences.
- examining the relationship between an author's position and his or her purpose for writing.

Focus on Language

Display the following domain-specific words that students will encounter in these texts. Then, have students make a KWL graphic organizer to rate their understanding of the vocabulary. (Spanish cognates are in parentheses.)

- treaties (tratados)
- policy (política)
- assimilate (asimilar)
- expedition (expedición)
- coexist (coexistir)
- reservations (reservas)



ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

Provide English learners with sticky notes to mark any unfamiliar vocabulary as they read. Have them translate the word to their native language or use a dictionary to write a simple definition in English. Then as students reread the text, they can refer to the sticky notes when they have questions about word meaning.

show me

In this lesson, students will read two texts about how westward expansion affected Native Americans. They will compare and contrast each author's purpose and his or her position on the topic.

Say: Today, you are going to read two texts on the same topic and identify each author's purpose. Remember, an author's purpose is why he or she writes a text — for example, to inform, entertain, or persuade. Identifying an author's specific purpose can also help you determine his or her position, or view, on the topic. After you read the texts, you will compare and contrast the authors' purposes and determine how their positions are different.

Have partners turn and talk about how a reader might identify an author's purpose and position on a topic. Ask volunteers to share their ideas with the class.

guide me

Use the paragraph in guide me to help students evaluate a text's main idea and the author's purpose.

Ask a volunteer to read aloud the paragraph and say something about the topic. It could be a personal connection, a connection to another text, or an unfamiliar concept he or she would like to know more about.

Then, ask a volunteer to identify the author's main idea. (The Louisiana Territory was a vast expanse of land. When the United States purchased it, the country expanded and people sought to move west.)

Finally, have partners turn and talk to complete the sentence about the author's purpose. (The author's purpose is to inform about the size and importance of the Louisiana Purchase.)

18

Compare and contrast authors' purposes to distinguish how their positions differ

show me


How can we learn an author's purpose from their position on an issue?

guide me

example

Read the paragraph below. Underline the author's main idea. Then identify the author's purpose.

The Louisiana Territory was a vast expanse of land. It stretched from the Mississippi River west to the Rocky Mountains and from the Gulf of Mexico north to the present Canadian border. In 1803, the United States purchased this land from France, doubling the size of the country and ushering in an era of westward expansion. The sale, known as the Louisiana Purchase, was an important achievement of Thomas Jefferson's presidency. The author's purpose is to inform about the size and importance of the Louisiana Purchase.



COMPARING TEXTS 69

VISUAL LITERACY

Use the graphic features in a text to provide an entry point for visual learners and struggling readers. Have students work in small groups to discuss the map on page 69. Then, have them draw a box around the words from the paragraph that the map shows and discuss how the map relates to the author's purpose. Ask volunteers to share their connections.

Copyright © Savvas Learning Company LLC. All Rights Reserved.

COMPARING TEXTS

87



work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following vocabulary words on the board and point out the Spanish cognates: **treaties, policy, assimilate**. Then, have students use the words to make a prediction about the information the text will include.

Read—Pause—Make Connections Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have student pairs take turns reading “The Movement of Citizens” aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, have him or her pause and share a personal connection.

On the board, write a few sentence frames to help guide the conversation, such as:

- This reminds me of _____.
- I remember reading about Native Americans _____.
- I think that Native Americans today _____.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Word Choice Remind students that an author chooses words that will enhance the portrayal of his or her position and affect readers’ emotions so they might agree with the author’s view.

Point out the word *denied* and the phrase “taking advantage” in paragraph 1. Discuss how the author uses negative words in the introduction to establish the view that Native Americans have been treated poorly for hundreds of years.

Then, have partners review paragraphs 5 and 6 to identify additional negative words and phrases the author uses to describe the treatment of Native Americans (“forcible removal,” “cold and disease,” “without any regard,” *forced*, “not permitted”). Guide partners to discuss how the use of these words affects readers’ emotions and views on the topic. Ask volunteers to share their ideas with the class.

check for understanding by having students answer the question about the author’s use of specific dates. (They show how the U.S. has removed Native Americans from their homeland for almost 200 years.)

work time

The Movement of Citizens

by Jill Kushner

- 1 The rights of Native American people have been denied for hundreds of years. When early explorers claimed land in America, a history of taking advantage of the people who lived there first began.
- 2 How were settlers able to claim the lush land that Native Americans had long inhabited? In some cases, the government made treaties with Native American nations. They were promised control of one area of land in exchange for the land that the settlers or the government desired.
- 3 Many times, however, these treaties were broken when settlers or the government decided they also wanted the land granted to the Native Americans. This often led to open warfare. Then the U.S. Army usually stepped in to protect the settlers' interests.
- 4 In 1830, Congress passed the Indian Removal Act, which was signed into law by President Andrew Jackson. It required many Native American peoples to give up their land and move to federally designated lands in the West. Often these were poor lands in which white settlers were not interested.
- 5 In 1838, the government called for the forcible removal of nearly 20,000 Cherokee people living in the East. They were sent off on a journey of 800 miles to what is now Oklahoma. More than a quarter of them died from cold and disease on this long walk, which became known as the Trail of Tears.
- 6 In the late 1800s and early 1900s, the U.S. government began a policy that encouraged Native Americans to assimilate, or become part of the entire American nation, without any regard for their rights or needs. Many Native American children were forced to attend schools where they were not permitted to speak their own language or study their own traditions. Sometimes they were even taken away from their parents.
- 7 Today, the struggle continues. Native Americans are still fighting to determine their own future and to gain rights to land, water, and sources for food.

check for understanding How do specific dates in the text support the author's purpose?

CRITICAL LITERACY

One way to help students think critically is to have them construct alternatives to the text. For example, have students consider how the text would change if it were a firsthand account written by a Native American forced off his or her land. Ask students to consider how that author's position toward Native American resettlement would be similar to and different from the author's position in “The Movement of Citizens.”



work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following vocabulary words on the board: **expedition, coexist, reservations.** Point out the Spanish cognates for each word. Then, have students discuss how the context clues in the text help them better understand the meaning of each word.

Read—Pause—Summarize Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have student pairs take turns reading “The United States Moves West” aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, pause and have the partner summarize the information they just heard. Continue the process until the end of the text.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Compare and Contrast Discuss that within this text, the author includes several examples of how people’s intentions and actions did not lead to their desired results. The author uses signal words to connect these contrasted ideas.

Ask a volunteer to read paragraph 1. Point out that the author says the Louisiana Purchase “inspired Americans to look west for their future.” The author then uses the word *However* to signal a contrast. Even though many people viewed the Louisiana Purchase as a positive event because it expanded the land owned by the United States, it had negative effects in the conflicts it created among new settlers and Native Americans.

Then, have partners review paragraphs 3, 4, and 6 to identify additional ideas the author compares and contrasts, as well as the signal words that show the relationships between those ideas.

check for understanding by having students contrast paragraph 5 in “The United States Moves West” with paragraph 4 in “The Movement of Citizens.” (Paragraph 5 includes different details than paragraph 4. It explains how the new areas where Native Americans were moved came to be known as reservations. Paragraph 4, however, focuses on the law that initiated the forced relocation of Native Americans. It also includes the detail that Native Americans were moved to areas where settlers did not want to live.)

Compare and contrast authors' purposes to distinguish how their positions differ18

work time

The United States Moves West

by Adam McClellan

1 The Louisiana Purchase set the young United States on the path to becoming the nation it is today. The opening of this new land to exploration by the Lewis and Clark expedition inspired Americans to look west for their future. However, these key events in American history also came with conflict.

2 The conflict began when people in the eastern United States began moving west. Even as Lewis, Clark, and their fellow explorers made their return trip down the Missouri River, they met people with boats loaded with freight. These people hoped to trade with Native American nations in the new territory.

3 Incoming settlers, however, were not moving into vacant lands. Native American people lived and hunted there as they had for thousands of years. It was hoped that Native American people and settlers would coexist peacefully, but this wasn't always the case, and the situation sparked fighting.

4 To resolve the conflict, the government and Native American nations signed

treaties setting aside certain lands for settlers and other lands for Native Americans. Though the treaties promised that Native Americans would have their lands forever, ultimately, they were not honored. Instead, more settlers moved onto tribal lands, causing more conflict. By the late 1820s, the government began a policy of separating settlers and Native American people.

5 Beginning in 1830, for example, many Native American people were forcibly removed from their homelands in the South. They were marched westward to a new "Indian Territory" west of the Mississippi River in what is now Oklahoma. Areas such as this came to be called reservations.

6 Within a hundred years of Lewis and Clark's expedition, the Native American nations these men had met were all forced onto reservations. The reservations included only small portions of the lands on which they once lived. Lewis and Clark unwittingly opened up the West for one group of people and closed it for another.

check for understanding

How does paragraph 5 in this text differ from paragraph 4 in the previous text?

COMPARING TEXTS

71

VISUAL LITERACY

Some students may feel more comfortable demonstrating their knowledge of text details through drawing instead of writing or speaking. For example, have students work in small groups to draw and label illustrations showing the main ideas in paragraphs 4 and 5 of “The United States Moves West.” Then, have volunteers present and discuss their drawings with the whole group.

➔ check for understanding

Analyze Author's Craft and Style Have students work with a partner to answer the **check for understanding** questions.

If students struggle to identify an author's purpose, use a Think Aloud to model how a critical thinker would approach the text.

Think Aloud I will ask myself questions to help me figure out the author's purpose. For example, "What does the author want readers to know? How does she portray this information?" Then I will use the main ideas and the connections between the details to identify the author's purpose. The text is mostly about how Native Americans have been mistreated and forced away from their homes because settlers wanted their land. So, I think the author's purpose is to describe how settlers mistreated Native Americans and displaced them from their homelands.

Use Text Evidence Guide students to consider the following question as they read through the paragraph: "What does the author want people to know about how settlers affected Native Americans?" Then, have students write the author's purpose and underline three phrases or statements that support that purpose.

➔ reflect

Have partners compare the author's purposes and discuss how each author's position on westward expansion helps readers identify each purpose.

Write the following sentence frames on the board for students to use in their discussion:

The author of _____ believes that westward expansion _____ because _____. This position shows that the author's purpose is to _____.

18 Compare and contrast authors' purposes to distinguish how their positions differ

➔ check for understanding

- 1 In "The Movement of Citizens," which group is viewed by the author as more important? How do you know?
Possible response: Native Americans are viewed as more important because the author continuously describes how their rights were abused.
- 2 Is the view of both authors relevant to world events today? Why or why not?
Possible response: Yes, in places like the Amazon, native people are being displaced. Also, Native Americans still need help on U.S. reservations.
- 3 What is the author's purpose in writing "The Movement of Citizens"?
Possible response: to describe how settlers displaced thousands of Native Americans from their homelands.
- 4 How does the first sentence of "The United States Moves West" hint at the author's purpose?
Possible response: It tells how the Louisiana Purchase inspired Americans to look west for their future, adversely affecting Native Americans.
- 5 Reread this paragraph from "The United States Moves West." Underline **three** examples of text evidence that support the author's purpose.

Within a hundred years of Lewis and Clark's expedition, the Native American nations these men had met were all forced onto reservations. The reservations included only small portions of the lands on which they once lived. Lewis and Clark unwittingly opened up the West for one group of people and closed it for another.

Author's Purpose: to explain how Native Americans were treated unfairly as settlers moved westward

➔ reflect

With a partner, compare the authors' purposes. Discuss how each author's position on westward expansion helps you to identify their purpose.

72 COMPARING TEXTS

CRITICAL LITERACY

Students become good critical thinkers when they are able to look beyond the words on a page in order to make connections with personal experiences and other texts.

Have students practice thinking critically by discussing these questions in groups:

- What did you know about the Louisiana Purchase before reading "The United States Moves West"? How did this text add to or conflict with what you knew?
- What information is included in "The Movement of Citizens" that is not included in "The United States Moves West"? What information can you synthesize from reading the two texts?
- What else would you like to know about how westward expansion affected Native Americans?

Compare and contrast authors' purposes to distinguish how their positions differ

 show me

How can we learn an author's purpose from their position on an issue?

 guide me

example

Read the paragraph below. Underline the author's main idea. Then identify the author's purpose.

The Louisiana Territory was a vast expanse of land. It stretched from the Mississippi River west to the Rocky Mountains and from the Gulf of Mexico north to the present Canadian border. In 1803, the United States purchased this land from France, doubling the size of the country and ushering in an era of westward expansion. The sale, known as the Louisiana Purchase, was an important achievement of Thomas Jefferson's presidency. The author's purpose is to



work time

The Movement of Citizens

by Jill Kushner

- 1 The rights of Native American people have been denied for hundreds of years. When early explorers claimed land in America, a history of taking advantage of the people who lived there first began.
- 2 How were settlers able to claim the lush land that Native Americans had long inhabited? In some cases, the government made treaties with Native American nations. They were promised control of one area of land in exchange for the land that the settlers or the government desired.
- 3 Many times, however, these treaties were broken when settlers or the government decided they also wanted the land granted to the Native Americans. This often led to open warfare. Then the U.S. Army usually stepped in to protect the settlers' interests.
- 4 In 1830, Congress passed the Indian Removal Act, which was signed into law by President Andrew Jackson. It required many Native American peoples to give up their land and move to federally designated lands in the West. Often these were poor lands in which white settlers were not interested.
- 5 In 1838, the government called for the forcible removal of nearly 20,000 Cherokee people living in the East. They were sent off on a journey of 800 miles to what is now Oklahoma. More than a quarter of them died from cold and disease on this long walk, which became known as the Trail of Tears.
- 6 In the late 1800s and early 1900s, the U.S. government began a policy that encouraged Native Americans to assimilate, or become part of the entire American nation, without any regard for their rights or needs. Many Native American children were forced to attend schools where they were not permitted to speak their own language or study their own traditions. Sometimes they were even taken away from their parents.
- 7 Today, the struggle continues. Native Americans are still fighting to determine their own future and to gain rights to land, water, and sources for food.

Copyright © Savvas Learning Company LLC. All Rights Reserved.

check for understanding How do specific dates in the text support the author's purpose?

➤ **work time**

The United States Moves West

by Adam McClellan

- 1 The Louisiana Purchase set the young United States on the path to becoming the nation it is today. The opening of this new land to exploration by the Lewis and Clark expedition inspired Americans to look west for their future. However, these key events in American history also came with conflict.
- 2 The conflict began when people in the eastern United States began moving west. Even as Lewis, Clark, and their fellow explorers made their return trip down the Missouri River, they met people with boats loaded with freight. These people hoped to trade with Native American nations in the new territory.
- 3 Incoming settlers, however, were not moving into vacant lands. Native American people lived and hunted there as they had for thousands of years. It was hoped that Native American people and settlers would coexist peacefully, but this wasn't always the case, and the situation sparked fighting.
- 4 To resolve the conflict, the government and Native American nations signed treaties setting aside certain lands for settlers and other lands for Native Americans. Though the treaties promised that Native Americans would have their lands forever, ultimately, they were not honored. Instead, more settlers moved onto tribal lands, causing more conflict. By the late 1820s, the government began a policy of separating settlers and Native American people.
- 5 Beginning in 1830, for example, many Native American people were forcibly removed from their homelands in the South. They were marched westward to a new "Indian Territory" west of the Mississippi River in what is now Oklahoma. Areas such as this came to be called reservations.
- 6 Within a hundred years of Lewis and Clark's expedition, the Native American nations these men had met were all forced onto reservations. The reservations included only small portions of the lands on which they once lived. Lewis and Clark unwittingly opened up the West for one group of people and closed it for another.

➤ **check for understanding** How does paragraph 5 in this text differ from paragraph 4 in the previous text?

➤ check for understanding

- 1 In "The Movement of Citizens," which group is viewed by the author as more important? How do you know?
- 2 Is the view of both authors relevant to world events today? Why or why not?
- 3 What is the author's purpose in writing "The Movement of Citizens"?
- 4 How does the first sentence of "The United States Moves West" hint at the author's purpose?
- 5 Reread this paragraph from "The United States Moves West." Underline **three** examples of text evidence that support the author's purpose.

Within a hundred years of Lewis and Clark's expedition, the Native American nations these men had met were all forced onto reservations. The reservations included only small portions of the lands on which they once lived. Lewis and Clark unwittingly opened up the West for one group of people and closed it for another.

Author's Purpose:

➤ reflect

With a partner, compare the authors' purposes. Discuss how each author's position on westward expansion helps you to identify their purpose.