

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

17

Language Objectives

- Identify the author's point of view.
- Explain how an author uses evidence to support claims.
- Use word relationships to identify the meaning of domain-specific vocabulary.
- Compare and contrast persuasive texts.

Building Literacy

Comparing and contrasting texts will help students move beyond what is stated by an author by:

- generating questions to monitor comprehension.
- making, confirming, and correcting predictions.
- examining the author's choices about what information to include.
- evaluating the author's support of his or her viewpoint.

Focus on Language

Display the following domain-specific vocabulary words that students will encounter in these texts. Then, have students use these words to create a semantic map about zoology (Spanish cognates are in parentheses.)

- captivity (cautividad)
- extinction (extinción)
- behavior
- descendants (descendientes)
- monitor (false cognate: monitor, monitora)
- coexist (coexistir)

Monitor and *monitora* are Spanish cognates for the English noun *monitor*. However, the word *monitor* is used as a verb in the text, so these are false cognates.



ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

Become familiar with common cognates in English and students' primary languages. Cognates are words that share origins and appear in similar forms in different languages. For example, the English word *school* is of Greek origin and it is similar to the Spanish *escuela*. For speakers of languages that share word origins with English, the study of cognates can be a powerful vocabulary-building tool.

➔

show me

In this lesson, students will compare and contrast persuasive texts about protecting animals to understand how authors support their points of view.

Say: Today, you are going to compare and contrast persuasive texts written from different points of view. In nonfiction texts, **point of view** refers to the author's opinion about the topic of the text. First, the author makes a **claim**, or a statement of what he or she believes. Then, the author uses **evidence** and emotional language to support the claim and encourage readers to agree with his or her viewpoint.

Have students discuss an issue related to the school or community, such as whether a new sports field should be built. Encourage students to take a clear stand for or against the action. Then, have students discuss which ideas and details they would use to support their viewpoint in a speech or essay about the topic.

➔

guide me

Use the Anticipation Guide in **guide me** to help students practice considering points of view. Have student volunteers read aloud the first statement: “Wild animals live longer in zoos.” Discuss that if students agree with this statement, they believe it is true and will be supported by factual evidence from the texts they will read. If students disagree with this statement, they do *not* believe it can be supported with facts or data. Prompt students write a checkmark next to the statement in the column that represents their **viewpoint**.

Then, have student pairs read through the rest of the statements and mark whether they agree or disagree. Remind students that they do not need to have the same answer as their partners. Instead, their individual responses should represent the viewpoints that they believe will be supported by the texts in the lesson.

17

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

➔ show me


What can we learn from an author's point of view?

➔ guide me

example

Complete the Anticipation Guide. Discuss your ideas with a partner.

| Responses will vary. | Agree | Disagree |
|---------------------------------------|-------|----------|
| Wild animals live longer in zoos. | | |
| Zoos help to educate the public. | | |
| Many zoos are in business for profit. | | |
| People know what is best for animals. | | |
| Animals have easier lives in zoos. | | |
| Zoos can help conservation efforts. | | |



COMPARING TEXTS

65

VISUAL LITERACY

Readers can strengthen their understanding of texts by making connections between words and graphic features. Have students work in small groups to discuss the picture of the rhinoceros on page 65. Then, have them write a caption for the picture, based on the details in the Anticipation Guide. (You may wish to have students do some additional research on endangered species.) Ask for volunteers to share their captions with the group.

Copyright © Savvas Learning Company LLC. All Rights Reserved.

82

COMPARING TEXTS



work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following vocabulary words on the board: **captivity**, **extinction**, **behavior**. Point out the Spanish cognates for *captivity* and *extinction*. Then, have students identify synonyms for each word.

Read—Pause—Predict Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have partners make predictions about “Captive or Free?” based on the title of the text and a quick scan for key words. Then have student pairs take turns reading the text aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, have him or her pause to confirm or revise predictions and make predictions about the next section. Have partners continue this process until they finish reading.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Signal Words and Phrases Explain that the author shows how ideas are related by using **signal words and phrases**. Have a volunteer read aloud paragraph 4 and point out the phrase “In addition.” Explain that this phrase connects the idea that follows to the previous paragraph by stating that the author is providing another supporting reason.

Have partners review the rest of the paragraph for other signal phrases (“For example,” “in turn”) and explain how they connect ideas. Then, have partners continue looking for signal words and phrases in the rest of the text.

check for understanding by having students complete the sentence frame about the author’s claim and support. (Possible response: The author claims that zoos can be helpful and supports the claim with examples.)

17

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

work time

Captive or Free?

by Patricia Walsh

- 1 Keeping animals in zoos has become controversial in the last century. As scientists learn more about animals' physical and emotional needs, people have demanded higher standards for the treatment of animals in captivity.
- 2 While some people think that zoos are obsolete, many people feel there is still a place for them today. They maintain that zoos can be helpful in educating us about animals. They can also prevent the extinction of endangered species.
- 3 Zoos have indeed changed over the years. For example, many zoos now feature more realistic habitats. Zoo officials say that these enhanced habitats are more stimulating for the animal and more educational for the public.
- 4 In addition, many experts say that zoos yield important scientific knowledge. For example, the study of captive elephants has given us valuable information about elephant behavior and biology. This knowledge, in turn, helps people preserve wild elephants in Asia and Africa.
- 5 Another example is the Bronx Zoo's early effort to restore wild populations of North American bison. Bison once numbered as many as fifty million, but their numbers dropped to fewer than a thousand by 1905 due to overhunting and westward expansion. In 1907, the Bronx Zoo began breeding its bison. These bison were then sent to a preserve in Oklahoma. Today, almost 200,000 bison in the western United States are descendants of the original Bronx Zoo bison herd.
- 6 Educating the public about animals also helps efforts to conserve them. The Bronx Zoo notes that each year its education program reaches 1.7 million students and teachers in the United States and fifteen other nations.
- 7 Zoos today have a responsibility to preserve and restore animal populations. They also have a responsibility to educate people about the needs of wild animals and their importance. When zoos focus on wildlife conservation instead of public entertainment, both animals and people are well served.

check for understanding The author claims that zoos can be _____, and supports the claim with _____.

66

COMPARING TEXTS

CRITICAL LITERACY

One way to help students think critically is to question which details are missing from the text. For example, the author only provides two examples of animal species that have been helped by zoos—elephants and bison. She has excluded examples of species upon which zoos have had a neutral or negative impact.

Ask students to discuss why the author may have left out details about other species and how the readers' viewpoint toward zoos might change if this information were included.

➔

work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following vocabulary words on the board and point out any Spanish cognates: **descendants, monitor, coexist, behavior.** Then, have students use each word in a sentence to demonstrate their understanding of its meaning.

Read—Pause—Discuss Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have student pairs take turns reading “The Price of Knowledge” aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, have him or her pause to ask his or her partner questions about what they just read. Have them continue this process until they finish reading.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Repetition Explain that authors often repeat words or style elements to emphasize important information. Point out the author’s use of questions in paragraph 4, and discuss what effect it has on readers. (It supports the idea that there are “many questions that should be answered before endangering the lives of wild animals.”)

Then, have partners read paragraph 6 and discuss why the author likely chose to repeat the word “must” in his conclusion.

check for understanding by having students complete the sentence frame about how the author distinguishes his point of view. (The author distinguishes his point of view from the example given in paragraph 1 by focusing on the effect of research studies on animals.)

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

17

➔ work time

The Price of Knowledge

by Samuel Gorey

1 Wild animals are studied by researchers worldwide for many reasons. For instance, researchers might develop medicines using the cells of wild animals, which doctors can then use to treat diseases.

2 This example shows how studying wild animals can affect human lives. But how can we know how animals themselves are affected by our studies? After all, wild animals cannot communicate to us what they experience.

3 For example, some animals' lives can be changed by pieces of research equipment, such as a radio tracking collar. This is a device that is placed around an animal's neck so that researchers can monitor the animal's movements. The collar uses a Global Positioning System, or GPS, to pinpoint an animal's exact location at any time, day or night, for researchers.

4 However, despite the capabilities of a modern radio tracking collar, there are still problems that researchers need to address. For example, what if the animal is accidentally hurt while the collar is

5 being put on? What if the collar irritates the animal's skin? What if the collar's electrical signals harm the animal? How is the collar retrieved without harming the animal? There are many questions that should be answered before endangering the lives of wild animals.

6 Scientists have learned a lot by using GPS and radio tracking collars, but we still have a lot more to learn. Many scientists study animals because they have a great love for nature or because they want to help animals and humans to coexist. However, as we have seen, people do affect animals' lives simply by doing research, and we must find ways to reduce those effects.

7 For the most part, humans cannot communicate with animals, so we can never know for sure how our behavior affects them. However, as we move into the future, we must listen to scientists' recommendations about animals and the environment. We must also make sure that scientists balance the benefits of their work with its possible consequences.

➔ check for understanding

The author distinguishes his point of view from the example given in paragraph 1 by focusing on the effect of _____ on _____.

COMPARING TEXTS

67

VISUAL LITERACY

Graphic organizers can help students evaluate the relationship between main ideas and supporting details. Have students complete a web by choosing a main idea from a paragraph or section of the text and writing it in the center circle. Then, have students fill in the outer circles with text details that the author uses to support the main idea. Ask volunteers to share their webs with the class.



check for understanding

Analyze Author's Craft and Style Have students work with a partner to answer the **check for understanding** questions.

If students struggle to understand how the author could strengthen the development of his point of view, use a Think Aloud to model how a critical thinker would approach the text.

Think Aloud I know that authors of persuasive texts, such as "The Price of Knowledge," develop their viewpoints by providing facts, details, and examples that show why readers should agree with their claim. The author's claim is that scientific research can be harmful to wild animals, and he gives the example of GPS tracking collars. However, this is only one example. To strengthen his argument, he should include more examples of ways research can hurt animals.

Point of View: Supporting Details Read the statement of the author's point of view aloud. Then, prompt students to identify three supporting details that the author includes to explain why his viewpoint is valid.

To help students identify details, ask the following guiding questions:

- What devices do researchers use to track animals?
- What effects can these devices have?
- Is it good for wild animals for humans to be nearby?
- Can humans change the way that wild animals behave?



reflect

Have students work in pairs to compare and contrast the points of view in both texts. Prompt students to refer to their Anticipation Guides as they discuss the authors' viewpoints.

17

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

check for understanding

- 1 Has the author of "Captive or Free?" altered your opinion about the topic? Use details from the text to support your answer.
Possible response: Yes, I was most impressed to learn that zoos can help to prevent the extinction of endangered animals.
- 2 How could the author of "The Price of Knowledge" strengthen the development of his point of view?
Possible response: He could provide other examples of how animal research can affect wildlife besides GPS tracking collars only.
- 3 What is the author's point of view about zoo programs in "Captive or Free?"
Possible response: Zoo programs can be beneficial if they are set up and organized responsibly.
- 4 How do the questions in paragraph 4 of "The Price of Knowledge" support the author's point of view?
Possible response: They provide examples of problems researchers may need to address regarding the use of tracking collars on wild animals.
- 5 Complete the organizational chart below with details that support the author's point of view. *Possible response:*

Author's Point of View:

People must be careful when studying wild animals to ensure that they are not negatively affected by research.

Detail: A radio tracking collar can harm or irritate a wild animal in certain circumstances.

Detail: People affect animals' lives simply by doing research.

Detail: We cannot know for sure how our behavior affects animals.

reflect

With a partner, compare and contrast the points of view in both texts. Discuss how the second author distinguishes his point of view from the first author.

68

COMPARING TEXTS

CRITICAL LITERACY

Encourage students to think critically about persuasive text topics by having them identify their own viewpoints on zoos and scientific research. Then, have students complete Venn diagrams to compare and contrast their points of view with those of the authors. Invite volunteers explain the similarities and differences between viewpoints.

Compare and contrast authors' points of view to distinguish how their positions differ

➤ show me

What can we learn from an author's point of view?

➤ guide me

example

Complete the Anticipation Guide. Discuss your ideas with a partner.

| | Agree | Disagree |
|---------------------------------------|-------|----------|
| Wild animals live longer in zoos. | | |
| Zoos help to educate the public. | | |
| Many zoos are in business for profit. | | |
| People know what is best for animals. | | |
| Animals have easier lives in zoos. | | |
| Zoos can help conservation efforts. | | |



work time

Captive or Free?

by Patricia Walsh

- 1 Keeping animals in zoos has become controversial in the last century. As scientists learn more about animals' physical and emotional needs, people have demanded higher standards for the treatment of animals in captivity.
- 2 While some people think that zoos are obsolete, many people feel there is still a place for them today. They maintain that zoos can be helpful in educating us about animals. They can also prevent the extinction of endangered species.
- 3 Zoos have indeed changed over the years. For example, many zoos now feature more realistic habitats. Zoo officials say that these enhanced habitats are more stimulating for the animal and more educational for the public.
- 4 In addition, many experts say that zoos yield important scientific knowledge. For example, the study of captive elephants has given us valuable information about elephant behavior and biology. This knowledge, in turn, helps people preserve wild elephants in Asia and Africa.
- 5 Another example is the Bronx Zoo's early effort to restore wild populations of North American bison. Bison once numbered as many as fifty million, but their numbers dropped to fewer than a thousand by 1905 due to overhunting and westward expansion. In 1907, the Bronx Zoo began breeding its bison. These bison were then sent to a preserve in Oklahoma. Today, almost 200,000 bison in the western United States are descendants of the original Bronx Zoo bison herd.
- 6 Educating the public about animals also helps efforts to conserve them. The Bronx Zoo notes that each year its education program reaches 1.7 million students and teachers in the United States and fifteen other nations.
- 7 Zoos today have a responsibility to preserve and restore animal populations. They also have a responsibility to educate people about the needs of wild animals and their importance. When zoos focus on wildlife conservation instead of public entertainment, both animals and people are well served.

➤ **check for understanding** The author claims that zoos can be _____ and supports the claim with _____.

➤ **work time**

The Price of Knowledge

by Samuel Gorey

- 1 Wild animals are studied by researchers worldwide for many reasons. For instance, researchers might develop medicines using the cells of wild animals, which doctors can then use to treat diseases.
- 2 This example shows how studying wild animals can affect human lives. But how can we know how animals themselves are affected by our studies? After all, wild animals cannot communicate to us what they experience.
- 3 For example, some animals' lives can be changed by pieces of research equipment, such as a radio tracking collar. This is a device that is placed around an animal's neck so that researchers can monitor the animal's movements. The collar uses a Global Positioning System, or GPS, to pinpoint an animal's exact location at any time, day or night, for researchers.
- 4 However, despite the capabilities of a modern radio tracking collar, there are still problems that researchers need to address. For example, what if the animal is accidentally hurt while the collar is being put on? What if the collar irritates the animal's skin? What if the collar's electrical signals harm the animal? How is the collar retrieved without harming the animal? There are many questions that should be answered before endangering the lives of wild animals.
- 5 Scientists have learned a lot by using GPS and radio tracking collars, but we still have a lot more to learn. Many scientists study animals because they have a great love for nature or because they want to help animals and humans to coexist. However, as we have seen, people do affect animals' lives simply by doing research, and we must find ways to reduce those effects.
- 6 For the most part, humans cannot communicate with animals, so we can never know for sure how our behavior affects them. However, as we move into the future, we must listen to scientists' recommendations about animals and the environment. We must also make sure that scientists balance the benefits of their work with its possible consequences.

➤ **check for understanding** The author distinguishes his point of view from the example given in paragraph 1 by focusing on the effect of _____ on _____.

➞ check for understanding

- 1 Has the author of "Captive or Free?" altered your opinion about the topic? Use details from the text to support your answer.
- 2 How could the author of "The Price of Knowledge" strengthen the development of his point of view?
- 3 What is the author's point of view about zoo programs in "Captive or Free?"
- 4 How do the questions in paragraph 4 of "The Price of Knowledge" support the author's point of view?
- 5 Complete the organizational chart below with details that support the author's point of view.

| | | |
|--|----------------|----------------|
| Author's Point of View: People must be careful when studying wild animals to ensure that they are not negatively affected by research. | | |
| Detail: | Detail: | Detail: |
| | | |

➞ reflect

With a partner, compare and contrast the points of view in both texts. Discuss how the second author distinguishes his point of view from the first author.