

14

Compare and contrast how different authors present similar events

Language Objectives

- Discuss author's purpose and viewpoint.
- Identify chronological text structure.
- Determine the meaning of academic vocabulary.
- Compare and contrast informational texts on related topics.

Building Literacy

Comparing and contrasting texts will help students move beyond what is stated by an author by:

- identifying the author's purpose for writing.
- evaluating the author's choices about which information to include and exclude.
- generating questions to monitor comprehension.
- making, confirming, and correcting predictions.

Focus on Language

Display the following academic vocabulary words that students will encounter in these texts. Have students use a KWL graphic organizer to rate their understanding of these academic words. (Spanish cognates are in parentheses.)

- secure (segura)
- recognizing (reconociendo)
- migration (migración)
- material (material)
- movement (movimiento)



ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

Provide your English learners with opportunities to interact with English-speaking classmates to enhance their language skills. Working in pairs or small groups will give English learners a chance to practice English in a relaxed environment.



show me

In this lesson, students will compare and contrast an informational text on the Great Migration with a biography of Robert Abbott to understand how the author's purpose affects the way an author presents ideas and details.

Say: Today, you are going to compare and contrast events in two informational texts. Remember that different authors will approach similar topics, events, and ideas in different ways. The author chooses which kinds of information to include based on his or her **purpose**, or reason for writing. For example, an author who wants to **persuade** readers to think or act a certain way may include more opinions than facts about events. An author who writes to **inform** the reader will include more facts than opinions.

Have students turn and talk to a partner about the differences between common author's purposes (persuade, inform, entertain, describe) and the kinds of information an author is likely to include in a text for each. Ask for volunteers to share their ideas with the group.



guide me

Use the statements in **guide me** to help students practice comparing and contrasting purposes. Have a student volunteer read aloud the statement from an expository article and say something to the class about what they read. It could be an idea that was new to him or her, an observation about details the author includes, or a personal connection to the text type.

Then, have another volunteer read aloud the statement from a newspaper editorial and repeat the process of saying something.

Finally, have student pairs **compare and contrast** the texts by completing the sentence frames about author's purpose. (The purpose of an expository article is to inform by presenting facts. The purpose of an editorial is to persuade by making claims and sharing opinions.)

Compare and contrast how different authors present similar events

show me

How might an author's purpose affect the way events are presented?

guide me

Read the statements. Then complete the sentences.

from an **expository article** about African-American history:
The Civil Rights Act of 1866 declared that African Americans were officially recognized as U.S. citizens.

from a **newspaper editorial** about African-American civil rights:
In 1866, African Americans were declared citizens of the United States, but the rest of the country was not convinced.

The purpose of an expository article is to inform by presenting facts.

The purpose of an editorial is to persuade by making claims and sharing opinions.



VISUAL LITERACY

Visual aids can help students make sense of challenging English language arts concepts. Have students work in small groups to design posters that list the differences between authors' purposes. Encourage them to use one color for each purpose and include illustrations where appropriate. Hang the posters in the classroom for students to reference throughout the lesson.



work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following academic vocabulary words on the board and point out the Spanish cognates: **secure**, **recognizing**, **migration**. Have students copy the vocabulary words and list related words for each, such as *security*, *recognize*, and *migrate*. Then, have them identify each word's part of speech.

Read—Pause—Discuss Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have student pairs take turns reading “The Great Migration” aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, have him or her pause to ask his or her partner questions about what they just read. Have them continue this process until they finish reading.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Word Choice In “The Great Migration,” the author’s word choice often reveals what he or she thinks about a topic. For example, have a volunteer read aloud paragraphs 2 and 3. Point out the following phrases and words: “not treated fairly,” “economic and social difficulty,” *challenging*, and *difficult*. Discuss how these details show that the author believes African Americans faced a hard time during the Jim Crow era.

Then, have students read paragraphs 5 and 6. Ask them to identify words and phrases the author uses to describe the effects of The Great Migration and explain whether the author’s viewpoint toward the migration is positive or negative.

check for understanding by having students answer the question about the author’s purpose. (The author’s purpose is to inform readers about the events that led to the African-American migration north.)

work time

The Great Migration

by C. A. Barnhart

- 1 With the end of slavery after the Civil War, African American life became freer but much less secure. Across the United States, but particularly in the southeastern states, two cultures existed. One was a white mainstream culture that was based on European culture. The other was African culture and the culture developed by formerly enslaved people.
- 2 In 1866, Congress passed a civil rights act, declaring that African American people were citizens of the United States. The fourteenth amendment soon followed, officially recognizing that citizenship, but African Americans were still not treated fairly.
- 3 The South maintained segregation of the races known as Jim Crow. This was a time of great economic and social difficulty for those who have been enslaved. African Americans had to attend segregated schools and churches. They ate at separate lunch counters, they found it challenging and sometimes impossible to vote, and it was difficult for them to find good schooling or jobs.
- 4 Many African Americans realized they needed to migrate from the South. News came from the North that economic opportunities were more plentiful in the fastest growing cities of the North, such as Chicago. Stories worked their way south that in these cities, African Americans could walk with their heads held high, never worrying about being insulted or threatened.
- 5 Many African Americans in the South, however, worried that they would not be able to adapt to life in the big northern cities. They were used to small-town living and mild southern weather. These people found strength in numbers and began to form migration clubs. These clubs would make decisions as a group about moving north. They bargained with railroad companies to get discounted tickets for their large groups. They attracted agents from northern companies, who visited them and offered jobs to members.
- 6 More than 110,000 African Americans moved to Chicago from the South between 1916 and 1918. And this was only the beginning.

check for understanding What is the author’s purpose in writing the article?

CRITICAL LITERACY

To think critically, students must understand that the author has made specific decisions about which information to include or exclude.

After students have finished reading, have them develop a list of questions they would like to ask the author. For example:

- Where did you find the facts you included in this article? Are they from primary or secondary sources?
- Where does the term “Jim Crow” come from?
- Why didn’t you include any quotes or graphic features?



work time

Introduce Vocabulary Write the following vocabulary words on the board and point out the Spanish cognates: **material, migration, movement**. Point out that this article is about a history topic, but academic vocabulary can be used across subjects. Ask students to explain how these words could be used to discuss science topics.

Read—Pause—Predict Use the following interactive strategy to promote a strategic reading of the text.

Have partners make predictions about “Robert Abbott’s Dream” based on the title of the text, a quick scan for key words, and what they read in “The Great Migration.” Then have student pairs take turns reading the text aloud. After each student reads two paragraphs, have him or her pause to confirm or revise predictions and make predictions about the next section. Have partners continue this process until they finish reading.

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style: Chronology Point out the phrase “In the late 1800s” in paragraph 1 and ask students to identify the year in paragraph 2 (1905). Discuss how these are clues that signal **chronology**, or time order.

Have partners scan the rest of the text for dates and signal words that show chronology. Then have students explain why this structure works well for biographies and history texts.

check for understanding by having students complete the analogy. (Segregation is to race as migration is to movement.)

Compare and contrast how different authors present similar events 14

work time

Robert Abbott's Dream
by Kathleen Cox

1 In the late 1800s, the Supreme Court ruled that segregated facilities in the South were legal. As a result, separate and inferior schools for African American people would continue to exist. So would separate and inferior entrances, seating areas, drinking fountains, and anything else that could be used to keep African Americans separate from and unequal to white people. African Americans knew that the phrase “separate but equal” was a lie.

2 In 1905, a young African American lawyer in Chicago saw what was happening and formed his own special dream. Robert S. Abbott was frustrated at being barred from practicing law in many places because of the color of his skin. He finally decided he would not fight racism in the courtrooms. Instead, he would fight racism with paper and ink. He decided to become a newspaper publisher and show the world the power of the press.

3 Abbott gathered important local news and information that would interest the African-American community. On May 5th, 1905, he had enough material to publish the first issue of his new weekly newspaper, *The Chicago Defender*.

4 *The Chicago Defender* was an instant hit with its readers. It became the first paper for African Americans to sell more than 100,000 copies each week. It even reached readers far beyond Chicago.

5 In addition, the newspaper helped set in motion a movement known as the Great Migration. This migration took place between 1915 and 1930. Article after article encouraged African American people to leave the South and migrate to Chicago. Stories compared the pleasures of urban life in the North with the despair of life in the South.

6 Abbott also addressed African Americans’ fears about moving north. He posted practical information to help them make the move, such as job postings, train schedules, and the names of local churches that would help them.

7 Through Abbott’s newspaper, people far from Chicago heard and answered his call. The smart businessman, who became a millionaire, had fulfilled his dream.

check for understanding Complete the analogy: Segregation is to _____ as migration is to _____.

COMPARING TEXTS 55

VISUAL LITERACY

To examine how graphic features can reinforce the words of a text, have students work in small groups to identify an idea from the text that they would like to see in a photograph, timeline, or other graphic feature. Then ask them to discuss how adding this graphic feature would help readers better understand the author’s message.

➤

check for understanding

Analyze Author’s Craft and Style Have students work with a partner to answer the **check for understanding** questions.

If students struggle to identify personification and its effect on viewpoint, use a Think Aloud to model how a critical thinker would approach the text.

Think Aloud First, I will find the example of personification the author of “The Great Migration” uses. The author says that stories about life in the North “worked their way south.” This means that people spread stories about how life in the northern states was better for African Americans. The author then describes how enough African Americans became interested in moving that they banded together to form migration clubs. So, the author seems to think the stories had a strong influence on helping African Americans in the South find new homes in the North.

Author’s Purpose: Supporting Details To complete the chart, students must find details in “The Great Migration” that support the author’s purpose. Ask the following questions to guide their thinking:

- Where were African Americans more likely to get jobs, in the North or the South?
- What was one city that many African Americans moved to?
- How many African Americans moved there?

➤

reflect

Have students work in pairs to discuss how the Great Migration is presented in “Robert Abbot’s Dream” and which text presents the event as more important. Encourage students to consider the author’s purpose for each text and whether the Great Migration is the focus or the text or mentioned as part of related topic.

14 Compare and contrast how different authors present similar events

➤ check for understanding

1 Think about what it was like to live during the Jim Crow laws. Explain why the idea of being “separate but equal” is flawed.
Possible response: If you are “equal” in the true sense of the word, there is no need to be separate.

2 Consider what Robert Abbott did to help African Americans. What can you do to support people that you see are being treated unfairly?
Possible response: I can tell my teacher or principal if I see something at school that is unfair. I can voice my opinion in writing.

3 What does the personification of the stories in paragraph 4 of “The Great Migration” suggest about the author’s point of view?
Possible response: The author believes that the stories about the North took on a life of their own and strongly influenced African Americans.

4 What does the author most likely think about Abbott’s response to segregation in “Robert Abbott’s Dream”? Use details from the text to explain.
Possible response: I think she thinks Abbot was smart because he successfully opposed segregation as a writer, not as a lawyer.

5 Use the chart below to identify the author’s purpose in “The Great Migration.” Then write two details from the text to support that purpose.

Author’s Purpose: The author’s purpose in “The Great Migration” is to inform why African Americans migrated to the north.	
Detail: Economic opportunities were more plentiful in the growing cities of the North.	Detail: More than 100,000 African Americans moved to a single city within a 2-year period.

➤ reflect

With a partner, discuss how the Great Migration is presented in the second text. In which text is the event presented as more important, and why?

56 COMPARING TEXTS

CRITICAL LITERACY

To foster further inquiry and connections, assign small groups to read a biographical article about another African American social activist from the Jim Crow era, such as Ella Baker. Have each group complete a Venn diagram to compare and contrast the details in their assigned biography with “Robert Abbott’s Dream.” Then ask volunteers to discuss how the purpose, structures, and details included in the biographies are alike and different.

Compare and contrast how different authors present similar events

➤ show me

How might an author's purpose affect the way events are presented?

➤ guide me

example

Read the statements. Then complete the sentences.

*from an **expository article** about African-American history:*

The Civil Rights Act of 1866 declared that African Americans were officially recognized as U.S. citizens.

*from a **newspaper editorial** about African-American civil rights:*

In 1866, African Americans were declared citizens of the United States, but the rest of the country was not convinced.

The purpose of an expository article is to _____ by presenting _____.

The purpose of an editorial is to _____ by making claims and sharing _____.



work time

The Great Migration

by C. A. Barnhart

- 1 With the end of slavery after the Civil War, African American life became freer but much less secure. Across the United States, but particularly in the southeastern states, two cultures existed. One was a white mainstream culture that was based on European culture. The other was African culture and the culture developed by formerly enslaved people.
- 2 In 1866, Congress passed a civil rights act, declaring that African American people were citizens of the United States. The fourteenth amendment soon followed, officially recognizing that citizenship, but African Americans were still not treated fairly.
- 3 The South maintained segregation of the races known as Jim Crow. This was a time of great economic and social difficulty for those who have been enslaved. African Americans had to attend segregated schools and churches. They ate at separate lunch counters, they found it challenging and sometimes impossible to vote, and it was difficult for them to find good schooling or jobs.
- 4 Many African Americans realized they needed to migrate from the South. News came from the North that economic opportunities were more plentiful in the fastest growing cities of the North, such as Chicago. Stories worked their way south that in these cities, African Americans could walk with their heads held high, never worrying about being insulted or threatened.
- 5 Many African Americans in the South, however, worried that they would not be able to adapt to life in the big northern cities. They were used to small-town living and mild southern weather. These people found strength in numbers and began to form migration clubs. These clubs would make decisions as a group about moving north. They bargained with railroad companies to get discounted tickets for their large groups. They attracted agents from northern companies, who visited them and offered jobs to members.
- 6 More than 110,000 African Americans moved to Chicago from the South between 1916 and 1918. And this was only the beginning.

check for understanding What is the author's purpose in writing the article?

➤ **work time**

Robert Abbott's Dream

by Kathleen Cox

- 1 In the late 1800s, the Supreme Court ruled that segregated facilities in the South were legal. As a result, separate and inferior schools for African American people would continue to exist. So would separate and inferior entrances, seating areas, drinking fountains, and anything else that could be used to keep African Americans separate from and unequal to white people. African Americans knew that the phrase "separate but equal" was a lie.
- 2 In 1905, a young African American lawyer in Chicago saw what was happening and formed his own special dream. Robert S. Abbott was frustrated at being barred from practicing law in many places because of the color of his skin. He finally decided he would not fight racism in the courtrooms. Instead, he would fight racism with paper and ink. He decided to become a newspaper publisher and show the world the power of the press.
- 3 Abbott gathered important local news and information that would interest the African-American community. On May 5th, 1905, he had enough material to publish the first issue of his new weekly newspaper, *The Chicago Defender*.
- 4 *The Chicago Defender* was an instant hit with its readers. It became the first paper for African Americans to sell more than 100,000 copies each week. It even reached readers far beyond Chicago.
- 5 In addition, the newspaper helped set in motion a movement known as the Great Migration. This migration took place between 1915 and 1930. Article after article encouraged African American people to leave the South and migrate to Chicago. Stories compared the pleasures of urban life in the North with the despair of life in the South.
- 6 Abbott also addressed African Americans' fears about moving north. He posted practical information to help them make the move, such as job postings, train schedules, and the names of local churches that would help them.
- 7 Through Abbott's newspaper, people far from Chicago heard and answered his call. The smart businessman, who became a millionaire, had fulfilled his dream.

➤ **check for understanding** Complete the analogy: Segregation is to _____ as migration is to _____.

➤ check for understanding

- 1 Think about what it was like to live during the Jim Crow laws. Explain why the idea of being “separate but equal” is flawed.
- 2 Consider what Robert Abbott did to help African Americans. What can you do to support people that you see are being treated unfairly?
- 3 What does the personification of the stories in paragraph 4 of “The Great Migration” suggest about the author’s point of view?
- 4 What does the author most likely think about Abbott’s response to segregation in “Robert Abbott’s Dream”? Use details from the text to explain.
- 5 Use the chart below to identify the author’s purpose in “The Great Migration.” Then write two details from the text to support that purpose.

Author’s Purpose: The author’s purpose in “The Great Migration” is to inform _____.	
Detail:	Detail:

➤ reflect

With a partner, discuss how the Great Migration is presented in the second text. In which text is the event presented as more important, and why?